Reviewer’s report

Title: Unusual cause of dyspnoea: an echocardiographic pitfall.

Version: 1 Date: 31 July 2013

Reviewer: Peter Matt

Reviewer’s report:

The report by Primus and colleagues is interesting in describing a patient with an iatrogen developed Gerbode defect following aortic valve replacement. The description of the case is well done, and adequately discussed. However, a more detailed focus on the surgical issues is necessary, e.g. what type of prosthesis was implanted, and what size, were there any special findings during surgery which would explain the Gerbode defect found later. Any findings on the intraoperative echocardiography? What are surgical options to close the defect, and what is the risk. I am surprised that the authors did not include a surgeon in their authors list. In addition, the description on the congenital Gerbode defect is interesting but could be shortened since the presented case is iatrogen.

Nevertheless, I would like to congratulate the authors for their case presentation.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

None.