Reviewer's report

Title: Integrated FDG-PET/CT Imaging Is Useful In The Diagnosis Of Carcinoid Tumors Of The Lung

Version: 1 Date: 26 August 2013

Reviewer: Shuji Murakami

Reviewer's report:

Major point;
1) As authors said some hamartomas, metastases, infectious/inflammatory lesions present nodules or masses with an ovoid/round shape and smooth margins. Therefore, it is sometime difficult to distinguish carcinoid from the other lesion. In this study, the authors did not compare the SUVmax of the other nodules with similar preoperative CT findings as carcinoid. Most of pulmonary carcinoid describe as tumors with low grade of FDG-uptake. If the cut-off value of SUVmax was reduced, sensitivity goes up, but the specificity would goes down. Then, some benign tumor and infectious/inflammatory lesions might often indicate positive SUVmax. In this viewpoint, the sentences at line 1-2 in the conclusions part of abstract seem overstated.

2) Discussion is too long and contains too many speculations. This part should be shortened and the story should be simplified.

Minor point;
1) Please correct the maximum range of patients’ age at lines 4 on result section.
2) Initial names of each patient were listed in table 2. These should be deleted.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.