Reviewer’s report

Title: Double esophageal duplication cysts, with ectopic gastric mucosa: a case report

Version: 3 Date: 11 July 2013

Reviewer: Harry Xia Xia

Reviewer’s report:

The study presents a pediatric case with double esophageal duplication cysts (EDC) with ectopic gastric mucosa. Esophageal duplication cyst is a rare disease worldwide, and there are only a few reports on diagnosis and treatment of EDC cases in pediatric patients. Moreover, EDC cases reported from China are scarce, and, to my knowledge, this is the first pediatric case to be reported in English. Thus, this case is of clinical significance, and adds in medical literature. The case report is clearly presented and the topic is reviewed in detail. Overall, the manuscript is well written.

Minor Essential Revisions

1. Abstract: “The respiratory tract symptoms” should be presented earlier, and the sentence “We describe a 3-year-old boy afflicted with double EDCs containing ectopic gastric mucosa” may be modified accordingly. Also, the cyst size should be presented with CT scan, not during the thoracotomy.
2. It is not clear to me what are the severe complications or consequences of EDC, especially those with a large size and/or without symptoms, if untreated. This is relevant to the management. If there are no severe complications or consequences, why bother to remove it with surgery?
3. Figure 3A and 3B should be described in the figure legend.

Discretionary Revisions

1. Discussion seems too long, and should be made more concise. On page 9, paragraphs 2 and 3 may be joined together. You should discuss your results where necessary.
2. As EDC is a rare disease, and I don’t think there is a generally accepted guideline for the management of the disease. If I am right, then the authors should make recommendation, with supporting evidence, on how to diagnose and treatment the disease. In fact, the authors have collected sufficient data, and they may only need a summary for the recommendation.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests