Reviewer's report

Title: Contemporary Incidence and Risk Factors for Carotid Artery Disease in Patients Referred for Coronary Artery Bypass Surgery

Version: 1 Date: 16 May 2012

Reviewer: Susumu Manabe

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions

1. Incidences of carotid artery disease presented in Table 2 are not compatible with those presented in Results section, first paragraph. Is the incidence of bilateral moderate stenosis 7% or 9.4%?

2. Are the p values in Table 3 and 4 the results of univariate analysis or multivariate analysis? If they were the results of multivariate analysis, other data such as Odds ratio or 95% CI should be presented here.

Discretionary revisions

3. The recommendation of this study to perform routine carotid screening for patients undergoing CABG is not considered rational. This recommendation is based on the finding that incidence of CAS was high in CABG population (moderate CAS: 24%, severe CAS: 8.6%). However, according to Durand et al. (you have referred this study as Ref 17.), the selective carotid screening reduced preoperative testing by 40%, with only a “negligible” impact on surgical management or neurological outcomes, although the incidence of severe CAS was 13.4%. The latest guideline (2011 ACCF/AHA Guideline for Coronary Artery Bypass Graft Surgery) recommends to perform preoperative CAS screening in selected patients (i.e., age >65 years, left main coronary stenosis, PAD, history of cerebrovascular disease[transient ischemic attack [TIA], stroke, etc.], hypertension, smoking, and diabetes mellitus). ( class IIa, Level C)

If you recommend the routine performance of preoperative CAS screening, you have to clarify the advantage of this approach based on your data.

For example, if you follow the recommendation of ACC/AHA guideline or Durand, what percentage of patient with CAS will be overlooked?

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests