Reviewer's report

Title: Ectopic thymoma presenting as a giant intrathoracic mass: A Case Report

Version: 1 Date: 29 April 2012

Reviewer: Meinoshin Okumura

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript describes on a large thymoma in the right thoracic cavity. The case is quite interesting, but I have several questions on this case presentation.

The authors insist that the tumor is ectopic. I wonder whether there was no connection with thymus. As far as I judge from the CT image, the mass can derive from the right lobe of the thymus.

The authors diagnosed the tumor as WHO type B1 thymoma. The microscopic finding of the tumor reveals that most epithelial cells are spindle, suggesting that the tumor is considered as WHO type AB thymoma. In addition, the authors performed several immunohistochemistry, and the spindle cells were not be stained by CAM5.2. Type B1 thymoma is supposed to be stained by CAM 5.2 while medullary thymomas are not frequently CAM5.2 (+). I require the authors to re-evaluate the histological classification.

Page 4, Line 14, the phrase “expansive growth to without apparent invasion” is something wrong.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.