Reviewer's report

Title: Technical Aspects of Single-Port Thoracoscopic Surgery for Lobectomy

Version: 1 Date: 16 December 2011

Reviewer: priyadharshanan ariyaratnam

Reviewer's report:

(1) Major Compulsory Revisions
(a) Although the title suggests technical aspects of single port surgery, there is very little description of the surgical technique employed such as (i) the precise incision location and how this was decided during pre-operative planning (ii) whether ties or staplers alone were used to isolate vessels (iii) how the pulmonary artery and bronchi were approached (iv) how and why radical lymph node dissection was performed

(b) The conclusion needs explaining (i) "Feasibility"- how is it feasible and does it take the same time as normal lobectomies (ii) "Better cosmetic results"- does the patient support this? (iii) I do not feel that based on this that surgeons should be encouraged to "perform such procedures" as there is no reported long-term follow-up. Hence the conclusion should only remark on the plausibility of the procedure as a viable technique in oncological resection and should advice the need for an RCT and long-term follow-up.

Perhaps it would be better to focus on just one of the cases and go into detail rather than submitting 3 cases with very little detail.

(2) Minor Essential Revisions: The spelling and grammar is very poor and the authors are strongly recommended to have the manuscript proof-read by somebody with a good grasp of the english language.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests