Reviewer's report

Title: Metachronous pulmonary metastasis after radical esophagectomy for esophageal cancer: prognosis and outcome

Version: 1 Date: 28 August 2012

Reviewer: Keiichirou Morimura

Reviewer's report:

Comments for authors

M. Takemura and co-authors examined the prognosis and outcome of pulmonary metastasis after radical esophagectomy for esophageal cancer patients. Recent advances in multimodal treatment for esophageal cancer leads to distinct improvement in the prognosis of this disease, but the survival rate and/or curability of this neoplasm are still un-sufficient. Especially, distant recurrence after radical esophagectomy is most difficult to control the disease status. Althought number of cases enrolled in this study is not large, this study could suggest the direction in the treatment for pulmonary recurrence after surgical resection. On this issue, this report is considered to be published in “The Journal of Cardiothoracic Surgery”, after the following minor revisions.

Major compulsory revisions
None

Minor Essential revisions
#1 Please exclude Table1. Following procedure after surgical treatment should be state in the text only.
#2 Five patients out of six patients with solitary pulmonary recurrent, underwent surgical resection. Are there any reasons why one patient took surgical treatment for pulmonary recurrent? Please describe the reason.
#3 In table 3, please note the site (right or left) of lung.
#4 English revise should be necessary.

Discretionary revisions
None

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.