Reviewer’s report

Title: Metachronous pulmonary metastasis after radical esophagectomy for esophageal cancer: prognosis and outcome

Version: 1 Date: 26 August 2012

Reviewer: Koichi Taira

Reviewer’s report:

Takemura and colleagues report the results of a metachronous pulmonary metastasis after radical esophagectomy for esophageal cancer: prognosis and outcome. They demonstrate that surgical intervention is an acceptable choice of treatment for solitary pulmonary metastasis in case of a good performance status in one institution. The date they provide may become useful. However, the following issues need to be addressed, and a minor revision may be necessary before the manuscript can be accepted.

Major Compulsory Revisions

#1) Pathological diagnosis is important for definitive diagnosis of pulmonary metastasis of esophageal cancer. Are these case excluded the possibility of a primary lung cancer?

#2) They say that surgical intervention for metastatic lesion is indicated when metastases are technically resectable. But they report metastasectomy for solitary pulmonary metastasis is an acceptable treatment choice in the discussion. I think resectable is different from solitary. What do you think?

Minor Essential Revisions

#1) How do you mean to undergo chemotherapy before metastasectomy for solitary pulmonary metastatic patients?

#2) The authors may make simplify of Table 1

#3) The authors may change word adjuvant to perioperative in second paragraph of the discussion

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests