Reviewer's report

Title: En bloc Extended Total Thymectomy and Extrapleural Pneumonectomy in Masaoka stage IVA Thymomas

Version: 1  Date: 8 February 2011

Reviewer: Hyun-Sung Lee

Reviewer's report:

Yang and colleagues attempted to evaluate the effectiveness of extended total thymectomy with extrapleural pneumonectomy for stage IVA thymoma. The authors concluded that en bloc extended total thymectomy and extraplerual pneumonectomy could be safely performed on selective patients with stage IVA thymomas and would achieve complete local control. Despite their appreciable efforts, there are some major limitations.

1. They analyzed only 7 patients with stage IVA thymoma. Surgical indications and approaches were heterogeneous. It is too difficult to draw this favorable conclusions due to small number without control group during short-term follow-up. In methods section, they had 19 patients diagnosed with stage IVA thymomas. Rather, I wonder the comparison data between EPP and pleurectomy for stage IVA thymoma.

2. The explanation about the rationale that the authors went first to do the surgery without neoadjuvant chemotherapy is insufficient.

3. In discussion, doxetaxel and cisplatin were chosen as the neoadjuvant chemotherapy agents. All had a partial response. However, CAP(cyclophophamide, doxorubicin and cisplatin) was chosen for adjuvant chemotherapy. I wonder the reason for the different choices of regimens between neoadjuvant and postoperative adjuvant chemotherapy.

4. Figure 1 was incomplete.

5. This article requires the extensive English-editing.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.