Reviewer's report

Title: En bloc Extended Total Thymectomy and Extrapleural Pneumonectomy in Masaoka stage IVA Thymomas

Version: 1 Date: 1 February 2011

Reviewer: Haruhisa Matsuguma

Reviewer's report:

The author reported their experience of EPP for Masaoka stage IVA thymoma. As author mentioned in the discussion, several experiences of EPP for IVA thymoma have been reported recently. However, the total number is still small. Therefore, this paper can add some information to this topic. The number of patients who underwent EPP for IVa thymoma is the largest to date. Among the 7 patients, one patient underwent SVC resection and reconstruction, the other patient underwent combined resection of atrium wall. All patients recovered and discharge safely. This information seems informative.

Major
First EPP case was 2005. Therefore, the follow-up period was too short to analyzed survival of IVa thymoma, because thymoma is indolent tumor. At least 5 year survival rate is necessary. Therefore, I recommend that the authors should focus on the safety of EPP and en bloc extended thymectomy for IVa thymoma. In this case, more detailed description of operative procedure and information including operative time and amount of bleeding are needed.

Minor
In the Discussion, an author of the name was misspelled.
Inshikawa #Ishikawa

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.