Reviewer's report

Title: Intraoperative device closure of perimembranous ventricular septal defects in the young children under transthoracic echocardiographic guidance; initial experience

Version: 1 Date: 26 November 2011

Reviewer: yongcheng dai

Reviewer’s report:

These authors report an observational study of 18 young patients undergoing the perimembranous VSD device placement via a mini-incision approach which guided by TTE. They noted a high likelihood of successful placement, and noted a high total occlusion rate. In some special restricted patients as authors stated, the hybrid approach may have a role in a subset of these patients who have defects which may be close percutaneously, and TTE can replace the part of the function of TEE. As a tread method, I think it has a certain clinical value.

Most of the writing is quite good. There are several areas where it appears adjustments were made in the manuscript without English editing. These need to be corrected.

In my experience, transcatheter closure and surgical repair have been reliably achieved with no mortality and minimal morbidity in the closure of the perimembranous VSD. Why the authors chosed their method? The authors stated their patients “aged from 2 to 36 months(mean±standard deviation, 12 ±6.5 months). Their weights ranged from 5 to 18 kg (10.2±4.8 kg). There were some special restrictions on the size and location of the VSDs in patients”. The authors mean there are special restricted. Do this method was used in other VSD patients? If so, how about other the patient’s treatment experience?

I would recommend acceptance with minor revision.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: no