Reviewer's report

Title: Natural air leak test without submergence for spontaneous pneumothorax

Version: 1 Date: 17 October 2011

Reviewer: Takayuki Kosaka

Reviewer's report:

The authors examined a new method for air leak test after operation for spontaneous pneumothorax. The authors used a transparent film and thoracic tube in a closed system instead of submergence test.

This report seems sufficient to be accepted.

I have the following comment.

Discretionary Revisions

1. Why does such difference of the operation time (about 30 min) occur between this new method and conventional submergence method? I do not think that such a difference occurs in the time required of two methods. The discussion about the reason is desired.

2. The presence of air leak might to be detected by drainage tube with this closed system in a simplistic form. Is it necessary to look at the state of the film?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.