Reviewer's report

Title: Repeated mitral valve replacement in a patient with extensive annular calcification

Version: 1 Date: 19 October 2011

Reviewer: Tetsuya Horai

Reviewer's report:

The authors reported an interesting case of re-operative mitral valve replacement with calcified posterior leaflet. This manuscript is well written with nice figures, and I believe it will contribute to help clinicians encountering the same dilemma during surgeries although the surgical technique described in the paper is not novel.

I do have a couple of comment.

I do not think the figures 2A and 2B are necessary since the operative finding was well described in the text, and it is not difficult for surgeons to imagine the findings without figures.

Authors stated that after the 1st and 2nd operation, TEE revealed the leakage. I am curious about the intra-operative TEE finding during the 1st and 2nd operation. If the authors have any information about that, I would ask them to put a brief comment in the result section.

In the 1st and 2nd operation, they did not replace the previous aortic prosthesis despite the high gradient (I think the value they provide was peak gradient) through the valve. I am sure the clinical decision whether the aortic valve should have been better replaced in the 1st or 2nd operation would be very difficult. Therefore, the discussion will be more interesting if authors could make some comment regarding this point.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

none