Reviewer's report

Title: Marantic devastation - bivalvular endocarditis with myocardial destruction in a patient with systemic lupus erythematosus: a case report

Version: 1 Date: 5 May 2011

Reviewer: David Durack

Reviewer's report:

Minor essential revisions:

The term "Marantic Devastation" is non-standard, and more suitable for a newspaper report than a medical journal - I suggest delete it from the title.

Case Report: The interval between onset and diagnosis of SLE and this presentation should be specified.

Page 4, last 3 lines: Suggest insert the normal ranges for the abnormal results; other results can be reported as normal.

Page 5: Calcification is not suggestive of acute endocarditis; it is more likely associated with subacute, treated or healed endocarditis.

Page 6: The investigator or lab (presumably Prof D. Raoult) who performed the "broad-range PCR" should be identified here.

Page 6: Specify the interval between surgery and testing for Legionella antigen.

Page 7: Was C. burnetii really the etiology of endocarditis in "the majority" of all 348 patients in this study? Authors please check wording for accuracy.

Discretionary revisions:

This case report would be improved by inclusion of figures to show the unusual operative findings (photographs, or a diagram if no photos are available), and the histopathology.

The term "Libman-Sachs endocarditis" is usually used for non-bacterial endocarditis associated with SLE. The authors should clarify the relationship between this term and the term "marantic endocarditis" and explain why they choose to use one over the other.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:
No competing interests