Reviewer's report

Title: Mid-term outcomes for Endoscopic versus Open Vein Harvest: a case control study

Version: 1  Date: 3 April 2010

Reviewer: thanos athanasiou

Reviewer's report:

Thank you for giving me the opportunity to review this article

i think that this manuscript deserves publication

it is a single surgeon experience but there is limited information available in the literature with regards the effect of endoscopic vein harvesting on patency at 12-18 months and the relevant MACE

i have some recommendations that can improve the quality of the manuscript

1. the power analysis that the authors have undertaken should be omitted as 50% power is not adequate

2. the table with the angiographic patency should be omitted as there is overlap with the text

3. for binary variables comparisons the appropriate test is the chi-square or the fisher exact test but i am not familiar with the symbol of the test that the authors report

4. it should be stressed in the introduction that although many trials have focused in early outcome there is a clear need for a multicentre trial focusing on patient reported outcome and HRQOL as this can be important from a patient's perspective due to the fact that a clearly angiographic focused trial requires large number of patients

5. the line at page 10 needs to be rephrased "we feel that it is unacceptable to accept a reduction in conduit quality during the learning curve."

6. the surgical techniques need to be described in the methods section

7. the conclusion in the abstract can be shorter and the conclusion section in the text needs to be reformatted as references in the conclusions are redundant

8. there are some more references reporting on patency and midterm outcome and can be discussed in the discussion

best wishes

Thanos Athanasiou
**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'