Reviewer's report

Title: Papillary fibroelastoma of the left atrial wall: A case report

Version: 1 Date: 11 March 2009

Reviewer: Davide Gabbieri

Reviewer's report:

This paper describes the case of a papillary fibroelastoma of the heart. The unusual and interesting aspect of this case is the localization of the neoplasm, i.e. the left atrial wall.

This report is extremely didactic and useful to get an overview on this kind of cardiac tumor, especially for a young surgeon, and it is worthy to be published. However, some Major Compulsory Revisions are necessary in the section Discussion:

• some surgical consideration must be included, for example the choice of the extended vertical transatrial septal approach must be justified, as well which is the time strategy of the center in case of patients who need cardiac surgery but with a recent ischemic neurological event;

• some details of the clinical case reported must be correlated with the sentences present in the discussion, to avoid that the discussion would be only a mere didactical exposition;

• in the part of the discussion concerning the clinical presentation of the papillary fibroelastoma due to embolism, the pulmonary embolism by right-sided papillary fibroelastoma, as reported, for example, by Gabbieri et al. (Papillary fibroelastoma of the right atrium as an unusual source of recurrent pulmonary embolism. J Cardiovasc Med 2006) is completely forgotten and should be reported to complete the spectrum of clinical presentation of the papillary fibroelastoma due to embolism.

No Minor Essential Revisions and Discretionary Revisions are present.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I am the author who firstly described the case of a papillary fibroelastoma of the right atrial wall which was the cause of chronic pulmonary hypertension due to recurrent pulmonary embolism.