Reviewer's report

Title: Concomitant ablation of atrial fibrillation in octogenarians: an observational study

Version: 1 Date: 29 October 2007

Reviewer: Mirela Scherer

Reviewer's report:

General
This is an interesting paper on concomitant ablation of atrial fibrillation in octogenarians. There are several issues, however, which significantly limit the value of this manuscript.

-------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The number of patients in the octogenarians group is very small. This limitation has been mentioned by the Authors in the “Discussion” section. It would be desirable to extend the study group in order to obtained more meaningful results. It is not really accurate to compare statistically a group of 28 patients with a group of 172 patients.

The underlying diseases in both groups are different, also the cardiovascular procedure. So it is not easy to make a statement about the outcome of the patients in the octogenarians group.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.