Reviewer's report

Title: Therapeutic Angiogenesis in Cardiovascular Disease

Version: 1  Date: 26 April 2007

Reviewer: Ray Chiu

Reviewer's report:

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1) In page 4, the "Vasculogenesis" is defined as "This happens during embryogensis...". In fact, vasculogenesis can occur in adult subjects as well, and certain stem/progenitor cells such as the circulating endothelial progenitor cells (EPC) can directly participate in the formation of new blood vessels. This is in contrast to "angiogenesis", in which the cells for new vessels are derived from pre-existing blood vessels through processes known as "sprouting" and "intussusception", as described by the author.

2) At the end of this paper, the author listed several therapeutic approaches for angiogenesis, including protein, gene and cellular therapies, and listed a few references, but without commenting on the outcome of actual clinical trial results. This should be of particular interest for the readers of this journal. Reviews of clinical trial outcomes in fact will show that although numerous smaller clinical trials were reported to have had positive outcomes, the results of virtually all large, well designed randomized clinical trials have been disappointing to date. Consideration and discussion of issues underlying such failures would be of interest and highly desirable.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

The format for subtitles should be consistent. For example, on page 9, the headings for items a. and b. are in bold letter, but items c, d and e are not.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

None

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.