Reviewer’s report

Title: A new shape for an old function: lasting effect of a physiologic surgical restoration of the left ventricle

Version: 1 Date: 16 October 2006

Reviewer: constantine athanasuleas

Reviewer’s report:

General
A small but well carried out study which follows ventricular restoration over time; the difference between this and other studies is the concept of shape that the authors stress is important in the longterm followup. The methodology is sound and the surgical method described well.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
A simple and helpful parameter to report, which can easily be calculated is the change in sphericity over time and how this relates to outcome. From the past, we know that ventricular restoration changes the long axis of the heart, but usually not the short axis. The data is in the study so it may be easy to report this as well.

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.