Reviewer's report

Title: Growing PET Positive Nodule in a Patient with Histoplasmosis

Version: 1 Date: 5 May 2006

Reviewer: egbert f smit

Reviewer's report:

General
MS Growing PET positive nodule in a patient with histoplasmosis: Case report by Salhab et al. is a good example of the difficulties physicians face when a patient presents with a PET positive nodule and a clinical suspicion of lung cancer. As such, this reports adds to the literature and is worthwhile publishing.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. Did the authors consider applying the Swenson model to assess the a priori chance of lung cancer? In particular, in the face of a known diagnosis of histoplasmosis (RUL lesion), the a priori chance of lung cancer of the LLL lesion is likely to be (very) low.
2. Did the authors consider to perform a wedge resection of the LLL lesion instead of an anatomical resection? Given the fact that there was a known diagnosis of histoplasmosis one might consider to perform a limited resection with intraoperative pathological diagnosis made on frozen sections.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable