Reviewer's report

Title: Cotrel-Dubousset instrumentation for the correction of adolescent idiopathic scoliosis. Long-term results with an unexpected high revision rate.

Version: 1 Date: 11 February 2012

Reviewer: Toru Maruyama

Reviewer's report:

This is an interesting abstract regarding the complication with CD instrumentation for scoliosis surgery. The authors reported exceptional high rate of complications, especially late infection.

There are some points to be clarified.

Major Compulsory Revisions

1) The latest radiological follow-up was 57 months after surgery. Clinical outcome in terms of SRS-24 score was obtained in only 35% of the cases. So it is difficult to consider this study as “with a minimum of 10 years for the entire study group” described in conclusions section.

2) As adolescent idiopathic scoliosis, patients over the age of 18 should be excluded from the study population.

3) Without bacteriological findings of any pathogens, how could the authors diagnose infection? Please describe in detail.
   Were there other findings suggesting infection?
   Where were the fistulae located? Sometimes we experience the breakdown of the skin over the prominent implant in thin patients.
   Were there obvious abscess formations around the implants?
   What kind of antibiotics was used for how many days?

4) Do the authors mean that there are a single case of metallosis, a single case with loosening of the pedicle screws, and almost all cases with breakage/fractures of the transverse connectors?

5) Sometimes it is difficult to remove CD systems. Are there any specific technique used by the authors?

6) Regarding the patients with LOSP, did the implant removal well relieve them of pain?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.

Toru Maruyama