Reviewer's report

Title: Cotrel-Dubousset instrumentation for the correction of adolescent idiopathic scoliosis. Long-term results with an unexpected high revision rate.

Version: 1 Date: 7 February 2012

Reviewer: Jack Cheng

Reviewer's report:

This is a retrospective study of 40 AIS patients treated with CD Instrumentation and posterior spinal fusion in 1990-1992 with a minimum follow up of 14.3 years.

There are a number of major concerns:

1. Small series of patients with mixed age of operation - from 13- 21 yrs old
2. Mixed curve type included - from right thoracic, left thoracic to thoracolumbar, lumbar and double curve. Severity of curve ranged from 50 to 100 deg Cobb angle!
3. Construct of CD instrumentation not analysed
4. Very high rate of revision 47.5% and infection accounting for 25%. Are they related to the severity of curve, curve type, instrumentation segment....... These have not been analysed- only average figures were provided
5. Only 14/40 completed to SRS 24 questionnaire, the latest clinical outcome and functional status not clear

Level of interest: Reject as not of sufficient priority to merit publishing in this journal

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'