Reviewer's report

Title: Effectiveness of Cheneau brace treatment for idiopathic scoliosis: prospective study in 79 patients followed to skeletal maturity

Version: 2 Date: 22 October 2010

Reviewer: Manuel Rigo

Reviewer's report:

In addition to my first report this is to confirm that the paper can now published with no major compulsory revisions. Conclusion is acceptable considering the study design. Cases were defined as progressive according to the literature. However I have still some concerns about all the cases being really progressive. When the initial Cobb angle is under 20º progression is defined when the Cobb angle increases 10º or more. Patients were accepted in the study, according to the inclusion criteria, when they had a Cobb angle of 20º or more, but it is not shown the number of patients with initial Cobb angle under 20º coming into the study after documented progression (is 5º enough in those cases?). Also, it is not sure that all cases over 30º will continue progressing. Risser sign under a specific value was not an inclusion criteria so a patient with a Cobb angle of 30º at Risser 3, for example, could show no further progression. May be the authors could add something in the discussion about this weak point.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests