Reviewer's report

**Title:** Treatment of Thoracolumbar and Lumbar Curves with P.A.S.B. Brace for Idiopathic Scoliosis: assessment of results following the S.R.S. Committee on Bracing and Nonoperative Management Standardization Criteria.

**Version:** 1 **Date:** 15 June 2009

**Reviewer:** Jean-Claude BERNARD

**Reviewer's report:**

1. The question is well defined but is not new. Whatever type of conservative treatment used, it's always important (necessary) to assess the results.

   This study is about the efficiency of the orthopaedic treatment, but doesn't prove by itself that it reduces the need of surgery.

2. The method is well presented and well described.

   Remark 1: in Background the author says that he will follow the SOSORT guidelines on standard management of idiopathic scoliosis, but does not allude to it anymore in the rest of the text.

   Remark 2: the inclusion criteria are well described but there are no exclusion criteria (for example the author doesn't explain why only 50 females have been selected out of the initial 70). The percentage of thoraco-lumbar and lumbar scoliosis isn't given either. However the author does not differentiate the results according to the type of curve. It would be preferable to study these two types of curve separately.

3. As far as the bibliography is concerned. The bibliographical conventions are properly followed in the text, but there is an inversion between reference 15 and 19 at the end of the Background.

   There is no reference to the evolution of the analysis of the sagittal plane for the lumbar or thoraco-lumbar scoliosis. Therefore it's difficult to talk about a three-dimensional analysis.

4. Yes.

   Remark 3: The author uses the lateral radiography only to check the ring-apophyses fusion.

5. As far as the results are concerned no comments have been made in the discussion on the correlations, be they significant or not.

   As far the discussion is concerned, no correlation factor has been looked for to explain the best results.
The author talks about torsion but he only made measurement on the rotation and doesn't give away any further information on the lateral radiography.

It's difficult to believe that there isn't any failure?

There's no conclusion.

Most of the X-ray photographs have been taken with a brace. The photo CF 1-95 has been taken without a brace but is 10 years old. It doesn't seem to be one of the clinical cases the author has axed his study on.

6. Yes
7. It has been difficult to analyse the text correctly because of the imprecision of the English. It would be good to have a second advice on the translation.

Thank you.

Jean-Claude BERNARD
Médecin Chef du service enfants - adolescents
Centre Médico-Chirurgical de Réadaptation des Massues
92 rue Edmond Locard
69322 LYON Cédex 05
Tél. : 04-72-38-46-06
bernard-mpr@cmcr-massues.com

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests’