Reviewer’s report

Title: Atlanto-axial rotatory dislocation in a girl with Spondylocarpotarsal synostosis syndrome

Version: 1 Date: 25 July 2006

Reviewer: Theodoros B. Grivas

Reviewer’s report:

General
This is a case report of a 15-year-old-girl presented with spine malsegmentation associated with other skeletal abnormalities, (spondylocarpotarsal synostosis associated with atlanto-axial rotatory fixation), which appears to be a rare case indeed.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
The paper is written with no respect to the authors guidelines provided by the Scoliosis journal.

Needs linguistic improvement, asking advice by a professional.

â€¦ gravida 3 abortus 0 â€¦ need formal description
â€¦ OFC â€¦ when using acronyms one must initially write the full term or word and then use the acronyms.

In conclusions is highlighted that â€¦ B) The methodology of studying scoliotic patients should be adequately outlined, however in this report there is no any Cobb angle reading, which is the traditional radiographic measurement on scoliotic spinal radiographs.

Is there any progression of scoliosis on this case? Is there any clinical and radiological follow up? What was done in this child for treatment, if any was needed. The answer to the above questions will be very helpful to the clinicians, and will elaborate the paper.

The paper must be rewritten and resubmitted for consideration.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published