Reviewer's report

Title: Fading Vision: Knowledge Translation in the Implementation of a Public Health Policy Intervention

Version: 1 Date: 30 September 2012

Reviewer: Rosemary Caron

Reviewer's report:

Thank you for the opportunity to review the manuscript titled, "Knowledge Translation in the Implementation of a Public Health Policy Intervention." I offer the following Discretionary Revisions for your consideration:

1. This manuscript presents a "very real" account of public health policy implementation in practice. The authors' work serves to highlight the challenges, mis-interpretations, and diverse perceptions that occur among the varied levels of the public health system. Further, this work provides a starting point from which an assumed, all-inclusive approach can be amended.

2. In the Discussion section, the authors may want to provide Recommendations for public health administrators to consider. The issues are illustrated but no recommendations for improving the process are provided. What would be a more appropriate approach for others who engage in this type of work?

3. Table 1 is helpful in comparing the KT process and the CF Improvement Process. Similar to comment #2, the authors might discuss how the CF Improvement Process could be amended since it is deficient in certain areas compared to the KT process. What do the authors think about the adoption of the KT process in place of the CF Improvement Process? Additional synthesis beyond the comparison of the two processes would be helpful to those engaged in this type of work.

4. The authors may want to consider, for replication purposes, the inclusion of the interview and focus group questions that were utilized. This information could be included as an Appendix.

5. It is not clear as to why the STIP and HL programs were selected as two representative public health programs.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.