Reviewer’s report

Title: Unpacking Vertical And Horizontal Integration And Integrity: Pathways For Childhood Overweight/Obesity Programs And Planning, A Canadian Perspective

Version: 1 Date: 2 September 2009

Reviewer: Runo Axelsson

Reviewer’s report:

This is an interesting paper dealing with multiple intervention programmes for childhood overweight and obesity. It is basically a conceptual paper developing a framework that may be useful for research, policy and practical interventions in the field of childhood overweight/obesity prevention.

However, I have three main problems with this paper.

First, I think the concept of integrity is not well chosen. The word is ambiguous in itself. The authors write on page 7 that integrity conveys a notion of consistency and cohesiveness, but in my mind it rather conveys a notion of independence or steadfastness. What they mean is probably “integrativeness” if such a word exists. The question is of course if it is necessary to have two concepts, or if integrity can be subsumed under the concept of integration.

Second, although the authors are clearly defining vertical and horizontal integration in the beginning of the paper as two independent dimensions, they tend to use both of them together very much in the following parts of the paper. I think these are very different dimensions and I think that the paper would benefit from keeping them more separated and analysing their different impacts.

Third, the paper is not so clearly structured. For example, the key concepts are introduced in the background although they would fit better in the conceptual framework. The headings are also a bit confusing, and it is very difficult see the different levels of the headings.

Beside these main points, I miss a few references, for example on page 9, where socio-ecological systems approaches are introduced.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.