Reviewer’s report

Title: Comparison of pre-bent titanium mesh versus polyethylene implants in patient specific orbital reconstructions

Version: 1  Date: 24 July 2013

Reviewer: Raphael Olszewski

Reviewer’s report:

- Major Compulsory Revisions
  None

- Minor Essential Revisions

1. In material-methods: How was the random assignment performed?

2. I don’t understand the sentence “Classification of maxillofacial fractures according to H. Wanyura.” It would better use some international classification for example issued from AO CMF foundation.

3. 0.6 mm cuts: do you mean slice thickness ?, please provide kVp and mAs to the radiological protocol

4. (Synthes, http://www.synthes.com/MediaBin/International%20DATA/036.000.607.pdf) should be (Synthes, CITY, Switzerland) please check

5. « Medmont M600W Automated Perimeter »: please check company, city, country

“patients were operated under general anaesthesia: by the same surgeon? Please specify

6. “In first group flat titanium 0.4mm thick mesh was shaped on solid individual model [Ti-Mesh] [7, 12], in next group virtual analysis of intact (mirrored) and affected orbital wall were used to superimposition to give superior and inferior surfaces for CAM individual milling from ultrahigh molecular weight polyethylene [UHMW-PE][13] were used to reconstruct affected lower or lower and medial wall of the orbit.” Sentence too long, please modify

7. « Statgraphics Centuirion XVI » please check the correct spelling

8. In Results section: please check the sentence: “The older was the patient was…”

9. In Discussion:

“Autologous calvarial bone grafts, porous polyethylene, and polydioxanone (PDS) were most widely used for orbital reconstruction. »: please provide with a
10. “Ocular motility was reduced most with lyophilized dura and PDS.”: please provide with a reference

11. “Preoperative and postoperative rates for diplopia and enophthalmos varied among the materials”: please provide with a reference

12. “Those results reveal continued inadequate evidence to exclusively support the use of any one biomaterial or implant for orbital reconstruction.” please provide with a reference

13. “Within the last few years CAD and CAM in reconstruction of orbital fractures becomes commonly used technique » please check English editing

14. « depending sex, »: please use word gender

- Discretionary Revisions
None

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests