Reviewer's report

Title: Unilateral versus bilateral thyroarytenoid Botulinum toxin injections of in adductor spasmodic dysphonia

Version: 1 Date: 2 November 2008

Reviewer: Christopher Y Chang

Reviewer's report:

- Major Compulsory Revisions

None

- Minor Essential Revisions

1) Please comment or take into consideration that type of injection (uni vs bilateral), dosing, and toxin type (Dysport vs Botox) are not the only variables that may influence outcomes after injection. Volume of reconstitution as well as concentration are also factors that may influence outcome as well as add to the difficulty in comparing different research papers. Reference regarding this: http://www.otojournal.org/article/PIIS0194599807001301/abstract

2) Include the actual scores in paragraph 4 of the results section.

3) On several spots in the paper, authors report on the "cumulative dose theory" as one reason for the relatively lower dose. Authors should explain what exactly the cumulative dose theory is as well as the factors that influence... ie, concentration, volume, total dose, number of injections, etc.

4) Include range bars for figures 3-5. Scatter plots if appropriate.

5) Unclear exactly what Figure 6 is to represent and how it adds to the paper? I would argue to delete this figure. If a figure describing NPS scores as it relates to outcomes is desired, a better figure needs to be made.

- Discretionary Revisions

None

Christopher Y. Chang, MD
Otolaryngology-Head & Neck Surgery
Fauquier ENT Consultants
Virginia Voice & Speech Center
www.FauquierENT.net
www.VVSC.org
Tel: 540.347.0505

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.