Reviewer's report

Title: TMJ metastasis: a unusual case report

Version: 2 Date: 28 December 2007

Reviewer: Wenko Smolka

Reviewer's report:

The authors have now corrected the language into proper english. However, mainly all other comments that I made on my last review are not changed nor answered.

Introduction and Discussion: You state that the first clinical symptoms of the case are extremely atypical. THIS IS NOT TRUE. Deviation of the mandible and crossbite as well as TMD-symptoms are the common symptoms of TMJ metastasis!

You describe the presented lesion as a bone metastasis. I still have the impression from the intraoperative view that it might be a synovial metastasis. Additionally, you reported that intraoperatively the condyle was dislocated anterior and there was a mass in the fossa that was removed. This sounds to me like the description of a synovial metastasis and not of a bone metastasis. A preoperative x-ray would be extremely helpful also.

I still do not agree with your comment in the second paragraph of the discussion: "What is even more significant is that the nature of the tumour involved was a non-small-cell carcinoma". The majority of metastasis of the TMJ are adenocarcinomas deriving from the breast, lung, colon etc. In cases of the lung being the primary site also squamous cell carcinoma is common, but not small-cell carcinoma.

Figures: I still think an x-ray is absolutely necessary to show the preoperative situation.

Figure 3: No corrections had been made: The magnification as well as the kind of staining must be added to the figure legends.

Please, write an answer to every single comment I made above in your response letter!

Even if you do not agree with my comments, please write an answer why you do not agree!!!

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable