Reviewer's report

Title: Circulating Immune Complexes and trace elements (Copper, Iron and Selenium) as markers in oral precancer and cancer: A randomised controlled clinical trial

Version: 3 Date: 13 June 2006

Reviewer: Ulrich Meyer

Reviewer's report:

General
This is a high quality study with a very good study design (randomized controlled clinical study). The authors present interesting results on a timely topic. The findings are of value in the determination of predictive values in the genesis of oral cancer.
The Abstract is well written and needs no alteration.
The Introduction section contains the most relevant informations in a good fashion.
The Materials and Methods section is generally good, but is extended to much. It is therefore recommended to delete the part of the PROFORMA OF STUDY (page 8-11) as well as the part of INFORMED CONSENT (page 11-13).
The Results and Discussion section has to be divided formally into a Result section and a Discussion section!!
The Conclusion as well as the references and the graphical presentation are good.
In summary, this is a valuable information for the readers of Head and Face Medicine.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
The formal issues (splitting the Results and Discussion section) and the letion of the mentioned phrases should be done prior publication.
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.