Reviewer's report

Title: A rare complication of maxillary sinus puncture - orbital adipose tissue herniation into the sinus: Case report

Version: 1 Date: 4 May 2006

Reviewer: Rodrigo F Neiva

Reviewer's report:

General
An interesting hypothesis of punctures from local anesthetic needles causing an injury capable of forming adipose tissue in the maxillary sinus was discussed. The retrospective analysis was well-illustrated.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
This paper is well illustrated but should emphasize that this is just a hypothesis. Presence of adipose tissue in the maxillary sinus could have a different etiology, as discussed in the paper. The lateral wall of the maxillary sinus is usually thick enough in young patients to prevent these punctures from happening. Pneumatization of the sinus cavity has shown to occur with age, so this hypothesis would be better associated with older individuals. The authors should discuss this issue.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)
Grammatical revision is needed.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
None.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published