Reviewer’s report

Title: Phase II study of two dose schedules of C.E.R.A. (Continuous Erythropoietin Receptor Activator) in anemic patients with advanced non-small cell lung cancer (NSCLC) receiving chemotherapy

Version: 2 Date: 12 January 2007
Reviewer: Andrea Mancuso

Reviewer’s report:

General

Dear Dr Hirsh,

the paper you sent for publications is interesting. However my criticism has not been fully answered. Overall, the results are not controlled with placebo, appropriate statistical analysis is missing and it sounds to me that drug dosages are not well calibrated. Moreover, the number of protocol violations is very high and reason of some patient withdrawal is not explained. I would suggest comparing higher CERA dosages with placebo in a randomised controlled trial.

Yours sincerely,
Dr Andrea Mancuso

What next?: Reject as not sufficiently sound

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.