Reviewer’s report

Title: The effectiveness of Tai Chi on physical and psychological well-being of college students: study protocol for a randomized controlled trial

Version: 5
Date: 12 February 2014

Reviewer: Kelli Allen

Reviewer’s report:

This is an interesting study that seems to fill an important gap in the literature on the effectiveness of Tai Chi Chuan (TCC) among college students. The authors make a good case for the importance of the study, and appropriate related studies are presented. Overall the study methods are appropriate and well described. My comments are mostly minor and some are related to grammatical issues.

MINOR ESSENTIAL REVISIONS:

Abstract
1. If possible, briefly mention the duration and / or number of sessions in the TCC intervention
2. Recommend changing “aims to prove” to something like “will test the effectiveness…”

Background
1. Sentence 4, recommend removing “for instance,” since this statement and study is really separate from the point mentioned in the prior sentence.
2. Sentence 5, recommend removing “were reported to”
3. Paragraph 2, 1st sentence, recommend removing or modifying “on the other hand.”
4. Paragraph 2, 2nd sentence, recommend removing “are faced with”
5. Paragraph 2, 3rd sentence, recommend rewording “the strong empirical evidence showed…”
6. Paragraph 2, 4th sentence, recommend removing the first word “the,” remove “and,” and add “with” after “manifested.”
7. Paragraph 2, 5th sentence, recommend removing “failing out.”
8. Paragraph 3, next to last sentence, consider changing “conditions” to “outcomes” or “symptoms” since this study is not targeting on individuals with specific psychological conditions.

Objective
1. Recommend removing 2nd sentence 2.

Study Design
1. Recommend changing 1st sentence to simply read, “This study was designed as a…”

Participants and Recruitment
1. Correct “well-advertised,” possibly to just “advertise”

TCC Training Group
1. State clearly the number of sessions per week.
2. There is also some repetition with this section and “intervention regimen.” Recommend combining.

Measures
1. 1st sentence, change “or” to “and”
2. “efficiency” go “efficacy

Statistical Plan
1. The statistical software is noted twice but only needs to be noted once.

Discussion
1. Overall there is a good bit of repetition between this and the introduction. There is also some repetition about psychological symptoms in 1st and 2nd sentence of paragraph 2. Recommend consolidating where possible.

Grammatical Issues:
Although the grammatical issues I noted in this manuscript are all minor, there are a fair number of them. For this reason I will list these separately and mostly just note the sentences I believe need some correction:
1. Abstract sentence 3 (remove “their”)
2. Abstract sentence 4 (change “is” to “are”)
3. Abstract methods sentence 1 (“trial” and remove change “sample size” to something like “participants” – or say “a sample size of…”)
4. Background sentence 3
5. Background paragraph 3, 2nd sentence
6. Background paragraph 3, 4th-7th sentences
7. Objective sentence 1.
8. Randomization section, last sentence
9. Discussion paragraph 2, sentence 1.
10. Discussion paragraph 3, 1st sentence
11. Strengths and limitations, sentences 1and 4

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.