Reviewer’s report

Title: Development of a clinical trial to determine whether watchful waiting is an acceptable alternative to surgical repair for patients with oligosymptomatic incisional hernia

Version: 4 Date: 12 January 2012

Reviewer: Charlie Goldsmith

Reviewer’s report:

1. From the previous review, the citation to the Mewes R et al paper in the reply 6. should be included in the text and list of Rs.
2. From the previous review, the way of handling the German titles in Rs is not correct. The Rs: 16, 19, 20 and 27 should have what is currently in (round brackets) deleted and then adding [(German)] at the end of each R.
3. P(age) 4, p(aragraph) 3, l(ine) 3. Suggest replacing [yet] by [at time of this submission]. P 14, p 1, l 2 and 3 states this more clearly.
5. P 12, p 1, l 2. [bpm] is lower case here but defined as [BPM] in upper case on P 19. Which is more correct; or are both acceptable.
6. P 17, R 21, l 1. Should [Der] not be [The] because the title should be in English? Also there should be a [(German)] at the end of l 2.
7. P 17, R 23. Should the first author had [Jr] after the initials like Rs 11 and 13?