Reviewer's report

Title: ORCHID: Open reduction and internal fixation versus casting for highly comminuted intra-articular fractures of the distal radius - A randomized clinical multi-center trial A randomized clinical multi-center trial

Version: 5 Date: 22 February 2011

Reviewer: Charlie Goldsmith

Reviewer's report:

This revised manuscript is much better. The replies to the issues raised seem to be reasonable. One issue was the numbering of pages, that last time I counted as 30 and the authors claim there are 22. I added page numbers for the figures and tables and with these the revised manuscript still contains 30 pages.

1. P(age) 3, p(aragraph) 3, l(ine) 5. Suggest replacing [SF36] by [SF-36] to correspond with the definitions and the rest of the paper. Also, P 11, p 8, l 1.

2. P 5, p 2, l 2. Suggest inserting [be] between [must] and [balanced].

3. P 9, p 7, l 1. Delete the [s] from the end of [months] to read [month] since there is 1 on either side of the goal.

4. P 12, p 7, l 7. Delete the closing bracket [)] after [CRPS].

5. P 13, p 7. Some of these tenses should be changed since the trial has started already. On l 1, replace [is] by [was] and at the end of the l, replace [have to be] by [were]. On l 2 insert [by] before [inclusive]. On l 3, replace [was] by [were].

6. P 15, p 2. Suggest including [SF36-PCS] as it is used that way on P 12, p 3, l 2.

7. P 20, Reference 42, l 2. Insert a closing square bracket [[]] after [sample].

I hope these help.

Good luck with the study.