Reviewer's report

Title: ORCHID: Open reduction and internal fixation versus casting for highly comminuted intra-articular fractures of the distal radius in elderly patients - A randomized clinical multi-center trial

Version: 3 Date: 23 December 2010

Reviewer: Charlie Goldsmith

Reviewer's report:

The response to the two reviewers seemed reasonable; however, this editor has a few suggestions for further improvement.
1. The pages of the revised protocol were numbered from 1 to 28.
2. P(age) 3, p(aragraph) 2, l(ine) 3. Insert a space between [>] and [65].
3. P 3, p 2, l 10. Add an [h] to read [health-economic].
4. P 3, p 4, l 1. Making a claim that you are first is rather bold when there were no methods for a comprehensive literature search. It would be better to tone it down to something like: [As far as we are aware, ORCHID is the first...]. Also, P 13, p 8, l 1.
5. P 3, p 5, l 1. Insert the date of registration and the date the first patient was randomized.
8. P 5, p 4. Delete [and statistically significant]. One can state that a hypothesis is statistically significant; however, the phrase is not part of the hypothesis.
9. P 6, p 2, l 4,5. What if there is disagreement?
10. P 6, p 5, l 2. Rewrite as [> 3)], ie, insert a space.
11. P 6, p 5, l 2. Rewrite as [BMI > 35 kg/m2 )].
12. P 7, p 7, l 3. Provide the viewpoints that the economic analyses will be from.
13. P 9, p 7. Table 2 was not included in my printed copy. Please provide it.
14. P 10, p 2, l 1. Replace [parameter] by [variable]. A parameter is a characteristic of distribution of a variable in a population, not another name for a variable in a sample. Also, P 10, p 6, l 1. Also, P 11, p 5, l 2.
17. P 12, p 2, l 5. Replace [principle] by [principal].
18. P 12, p 3, l 11. Since [or] logically includes [and], drop [and/].
19. P 12, p 5, l 3,4. Provide references to GCP and DH.

21. P 15, box, row 1, column 1, l 1. Add an [s] to [Investigators] since there are 2.

A random sample of references was checked for accuracy. This reviewer thinks that the issue number helps to find the article faster when searching for it.

22. P 16, R(eference) 1, l 2. Insert [(3)] after [52].


25. P 17, R 15, l 2. Insert [(3)] after [30].

26. P 17, R 17, l 3. Insert [(5)] after [35].

27. P 17, R 20, l 3. Insert [(3)] after [34].

28. P 17, R 21, l 3. The journal name is [J Trauma Injury, Infection & Critical Care], and insert [(1)] after [55].

29. P 17, R 25, l 4. Insert [(4)] after [23].

30. P 18, R 28, l 4. Insert [(2)] after [31].

31. P 18, R 36, l 3. Insert [(3)] after [31].