Reviewer’s report

Title: Early postoperative cognitive dysfunction and postoperative delirium after anaesthesia with various hypnotics: a double blind, prospective, randomized, controlled clinical trial - The PINOCCHIO trial -

Version: 7 Date: 23 May 2011

Reviewer: Charlie Goldsmith

Reviewer’s report:

The answers provided by the authors appear to have corrected the issues raised in the previous reviews. However, although answered as if they were correct, indeed they were NOT.

Previous comments not fixed.

14. Provide a reference to the Dunnett test. Reference 33 does not mention the Dunnett test. Why not provide the citation to one of Dunnett’s papers such as: Dunnett CW. A multiple comparison procedure for comparing several treatments with a control. Journal of the American Statistical Association 1955;50:1096-1121.

16. The appendix still contains 2 boxes for each response, so it has NOT been changed.

23. I checked the SAS website and still could not find the [Farrington and Manning Test] nor any reference to it. Why not quote the paper: Farrington CP and Manning G. Test statistics and sample size formulae for comparative binomial trials with null hypothesis of non-zero risk difference or non-unity relative risk. Statistics in Medicine 1990; 9, 1447-1454.

New issues in revised paper.

1. P(age) 9, (ine) 2. Replace [both] by [all]. There are 3 groups in this trial.


3. P 31, R 27, I 3. Insert a space to read [cognitive impairment].


5. P 32, R 33. Provide a better R. See 14 above.