Reviewer's report

Title: Comparison of early-, late-, and non-participants in a school-based asthma management program for urban high school students

Version: 3 Date: 14 April 2011

Reviewer: Robert A Oster

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
None

Minor Essential Revisions
1. Results, line 177 – please remove the right parenthesis after “p=0.02”.

Discretionary Revisions
None

Comment

The additional information on the various comparisons that you provide in the revised text negates the need for adding p-values to Table 1. I believe that you really tried to do this, and noticed that the table would “become too confusing and difficult to read”. I noted in my prior review that adding the p-values might make the table unwieldy – this is why I considered this as a discretionary revision. So I concur with your decision to leave Table 1 as it is now presented.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.