Reviewer's report

Title: The Effectiveness of Early Lens Extraction with Intraocular Lens Implantation for the treatment of Primary Angle Closure Glaucoma: A Randomised Controlled Trial.

Version: 2 Date: 11 January 2011

Reviewer: Charlie Goldsmith

Reviewer's report:

In general, this protocol is well done; however, there are few suggestions to possibly improve it for the benefit of readers.

1. Title P(age), l(ine) 4. Please insert the date of registration and the date the first patient was randomized.

2. Title P, l 6. While a study group is the claimed authorship, the list of team members, steering committee members and additional member were listed on P 8. Should any others be part of the authorship?

3. This reviewer thinks it would be helpful to have an appendix of short forms used in the study. For example, it looks as if [IOP] is not defined yet used on P 2, p(aragraph) 2, l 5.

4. P 2, p 3, l 6. Provide a reference for the details of the drugs used, such a form, dosage, frequency etc. that may be of interest to a potential reader.

5. P 3, p 2, l 1. Suggest replacing [recent] by [2006]. Recent fades with time; however, the date is always relevant.

6. P 3, p 4. Since there are really 3 questions and apparently 3 hypotheses, it would be helpful to state it as such, and whether they will separately or simultaneously tested.

7. P 3, p 5. l 2. There is no need to have both the [at least 50 years old] on l 2 as well as 5th b(ullet).

8. P 3, p 5, b 1, l 7. Since [or] logically includes [and], drop [and/]

9. P 3, p 5, b 1, l 6. Rewrite as [P < 0.05], with a space on either side.

10. P 3, p 5, b 1, l 9. Rewrite as [> 21 mm Hg].

11. P 3, p 5, b 3, l 1. Drop [and/].

12. P 3, p 5, b 3, l 2. Rewrite as [# 30 mm].

13. P 3, p 6, b 1, l 2. Rewrite as [-15 dB] or (ii) cup-disc-ratio # 0.9].

14. P 4, p 2, l 6. Each of these instruments should be briefly described to give a reader information on scoring and interpretation. The EQ-5D should also be referenced.

15. P 4, p 2, l 2. Provide a reference to the website that does this as well as any reviews of its veracity.
16. P 4, p 2, l 5. Provide levels for ethnicity and centres. The other minimisation factor levels are clear. Also, provide a reference to minimisation.


18. P 6, p 3, l 4. Is the plan to compute the QALYs over 3 years? If so, state it. Is any discounting going to be used?

19. P 6, p 5, b 3. Since incidence is a time related rate, what time will be used? Annual?

20. P 6, p 8, l 2. Rewrite as [> 10].

21. P 6, p 10, l 3. Is there a reference to the charter and responsibilities of the DMC?

22. P 7, p 1, l 6. Reference the forms of imputation analysis that will be used with any missing data. It would also be useful to know what types of sensitivity analyses are planned, with suitable references.

23. P 7, p 1, l 12 to 14. For these 2 sub-group analyses, will interactions be tested? And is there a reference as to why these subgroups should be tested?

24. P 7, p 2. Apart from redundancy, what else will be done to add to the validity of the scale?

25. P 7, p 3, l 5. What is the reference for 0.05 minimum clinically important difference in QALYs? And the 15% in l 15, just like the 2 mm Hg in l 12.

A random sample of 10 R(eference)s was checked for accuracy. Also, Trials tries to publish all authors, not just the first 6 et al. This reviewer also likes to see the issue number as it makes finding the reference easier for a reader.

26. P 9, R 1,l 2. Insert [(11)] after [85].

27. P 9, R 2, l 2. Insert [(3)] after [90].

28. P 9, R 3, l 1. Insert [(10) after [87].

29. P 9, R 5, l 2. Insert [(8) after [84].

30. P 9, R 7, l 2. Insert [(2)] after [86].

31. P 9, R 9, l 3. Insert [(8)] after [112].

32. P 9, R 12, 15. Insert the rest of the authors.

33. P 10, R 18. This reviewer could not reference this source. Is it accurate?

34. P 10, R 21, l 3. Insert [(4)] after [107].

35. P 10, R 23, l 1. Insert the other 2 authors, and on l 3 insert [(3)] after [113].

36. P 10, R 24, l 1. Replace [et al] by [Early Manifest Glaucoma Trial Group] and in l 3, insert [(1)] after [121].