Reviewer's report

Title: A Phase II Clinical Trial to assess the safety of Clonidine in Acute Organophosphate Poisoning

Version: 3 Date: 16 February 2009

Reviewer: James M Wright

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript describes a phase II trial of clonidine in the management of organophosphate overdose. The main strength of the study is that they were able to recruit and study 48 patients.

The main weakness of the study is that they did not make a strong case for doing the study. It is not clear to me that there is evidence demonstrating the benefit of clonidine in animals who were optimally treated with atropine and pralidoxime or at minimum in animals optimally treated with atropine.

In the present study clonidine is given in addition to treatment with atropine and in some cases with pralidoxime.

Major Compulsory revision:

The authors must demonstrate whether the use of clonidine in patients is justified by research in animals that is in the same setting as the setting in patients.

In the second paragraph of the discussion they state that there were no serious adverse events. That is not the case as all deaths and events leading to prolongation of hospitalization are serious adverse events (SAEs). Total SAEs per group must be added to Table 3.

Conclusions need to be revised.

In my opinion the results of this trial are not sufficiently promising to justify a larger trial.

Minor Essential Revisions.

There are a number of typographical errors that need to be corrected. eg. "For example, we found that blood pressure was measured twice more frequency in the active arm." For example, blood pressure was measured twice as frequently in the active arms as compared to the placebo arm.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.