Reviewer's report

Title: Severe male infertility after failed ICSI treatment- a phenomenological study of men's experiences

Version: 1 Date: 22 December 2010

Reviewer: Tewes Wischmann

Reviewer's report:

This is a very interesting qualitative study on men's experience of severe male factor infertility. The study question is clearly of clinical relevance, the sample size is sufficient for this qualitative approach. (Nearly) all of the relevant literature is covered (please add Edelmann & Connolly 2000 and Webb & Daniluk 1999; minor essential revision). The conclusions drawn from the results are adequate.

minor essential revision: It should be stated more clearly that not all of the men/couples remained childless after ART (e.g. adoption or DI). In this context: How to understand the last sentence before the discussion section "...half from her and half from me" when ART treatment was not successful? If it would be a child after DI the sentence makes no sense.

minor essential revision: A short discussion of a possible response bias should be added in the discussion section of the paper (about one half of the men approached in the study did not participate).

references:

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.