Reviewer's report

Title: Pre-dementia in Alzheimer's disease

Version: 3 Date: 1 November 2010

Reviewer: James A. Mortimer

Reviewer's report:

Minor Essential Revisions

Figure 1 is confusing. There are lots of arrows, some of which have very little experimental support. The reason for the solid and dotted lines is never explained in the text or in the legend. If the intention is that the solid arrows represent some main pathway to dementia and the dotted arrows possible side paths, Figure 1 is incorrect. Recent studies have demonstrated that while accumulation of soluble A beta is likely the initial event, induction of NFT is essential to the subsequent atrophy and dementia. Putting NFT in a side path with a dotted arrow does not make sense. If the authors wish to use this figure, they must explain the pathways they show. Also, atrophy subsequent to NFT formation is an important part of the pathway to dementia, but is omitted in the Figure. Because Figure 1 opens Pandora's box, the authors may simply want to eliminate it altogether. The text is very general, but no misstatement is made.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.