Reviewer's report

Title: Combination Strategies for Pandemic Preparedness and Response

Version: 1 Date: 14 September 2009

Reviewer: carl heneghan

Reviewer's report:

Title:
It is unclear from the title that this is a systematic review and that it is restricted to modelling studies alone

Abstract
The abstract should be written to focus the specific question the review addresses and outline those strategies that are effective and no make statements like several an such as. These are not scientific statements

Intro
Consider changing promulgated to made public – keeps the English simple and easy to understand

Line 8 paragraph refer o these strategies without defining what these strategies are

The aim of this paper should be more explicit at the end of the introduction

Issues should include: what are the components of a combination strategy and the quantitative impact in terms of what outcome

METHODS
The search strategy is limited by the search of only one database – this means the likelihood of missing papers is high why is this

Results
The paper would be enhanced with a good comprehensive description of what each of the interventions is. This would be useful in a BOX ie social distancing comprises ..................................

The concept of Ro should be outlined in the methods

The results should consistently refer to the influenza strain studied

Do the modelling studies present confidence intervals and p values without these, results are of no value, if they don't you should state this explicitly in the methods

To make more of this paper I would consider re organizing it by influenza type

For H5N1 the following factors significantly decreased transmission.....................

For H1N1.........
For seasonal influenza.........etc
Also consider organizing the results into high and low Ro results which may help the reader to understand the impact
Ie. At high Ro rates the following components were effective..................
Discussion
There needs to be a comprehensive discussion around the limitations of modelling approaches of the review and the findings
Also the modelling studies need to be discusses in the light of other study type e.g. antivirals are pretty useless at preventing transmission in RCT studies.