Reviewer's report

**Title:** Channelling professionalization processes to better fit medicine to the changing population health needs

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 30 July 2009

**Reviewer:** Glyn Elwyn

**Reviewer's report:**

Channelling professionalization etc - Plochg, Klazinga and Starfield.

This is a novel paper, raising an issue that has global relevance - that of increasing technical specialisation without regard to the coordinated care of patients with multimorbidity. It should be published.

I think it can be improved.

The title does not really do justice to the challenge it highlights and neither does the abstract do the work which it needs to do.

The paper could do with more signposting and the 7 strategies could do with a either a summary bullet list or a table of sorts just to highlight its central role if nothing else.

I think the intro could pose a tighter issue - more urgent issue - that of technical versus coordination around the person, never mind the population. So many elderly people become lost in sub-specialisations and competing therapies that primary care physicians find hard to comprehend or change given the power of specialist advice.

They mention a 'rich sociological literature' but it is not cited. One very important literature is the book by Collins and Evans on 'rethinking expertise' - and the problem of demarcation they pose at the end of their book. Specialist expertise is all about marking new turf and creating new fences by exams and colleges. This is one lever they do not mention in the 7 strategies. Colleges create specialists.

In summary: this is a must publish paper in my view - but it has much greater chance of having an impact if the authors get more clarity and force into their arguments and presentation. Their willingness to raise this vital issue deserves this work.

Glyn Elwyn
Cardiff University

**Which journal?:** Appropriate or potentially appropriate for BMC Medicine: an exceptionally interesting article
What next?: Offer publication in BMC Health Services Research after minor essential revisions

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.