Reviewer’s report

Title: Lack of association of two common polymorphisms on 9q21 with risk of coronary heart disease and myocardial infarction

Version: 1 Date: 24 February 2008

Reviewer: Edith Feskens

Reviewer’s report:

Reports on the association between two SNPs on 9q21 that were recently emerged from GWAS and incidence of MI/CHD in the Rotterdam study, 7983 elderly men and women followed for 9.8 yrs. In this cohort the two SNPS were not associated with MI or CHD, so replication failed.

Major Compulsory revisions:

To increase the strength of the paper sufficiently, the allele frequencies of the prevalent cases should be shown, and Cox analyses with age rather than time on the axes should be conducted or alternatively, only cases occurring before age 70 should be analysed.

Number of cases in text and Table 1 should be similar. The fact that these are different now does not enhance the credibility of the results.

The paper is also easier to read if results of additive model are included in table 2 as well.

Which journal?: Not appropriate for BMC Medicine: an article whose findings are important to those with closely related interests and more suited to BMC Cardiovascular Disorders

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.