Reviewer's report

Title: Kisspeptin and GPR54 immunoreactivity in a cohort of 518 patients defines favourable prognosis and clear cell subtype in ovarian carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 26 June 2007

Reviewer: Tracey Amanda Martin

Reviewer's report:

General
A well written paper with interesting results and observations. The work would have benefited considerably from additional techniques in analysing the expression of Kisspeptin and GPR54 in this tissue cohort. The advent of Q-PCR and micro-array technology is making a study of this kind too simplistic.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions
1. The authors should make clear why they are investigating the relevance and expression of Kisspeptin and GPR54 in ovarian carcinoma. What lead them to look at these specifically? Was there undisclosed evidence prompting this work?
2. The discussion is somewhat over-long and should be shortened. Much is made of the short comings of others work, they should better discuss their own results.
3. Results must be shown for KP-10, not just mentioned in the results section.
4. Figure 2 requires additional higher powered magnification to make the staining more visible.
5. Arrows should indicate positive staining in both Figures 1 and 2.
6. The text does not adequately describe Figures 1 and 2: each section is labelled but this is not reflected in the text.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions
1. The odd typo. eg. Page 5, line 8, observe should be observed. Please proof-read again.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions
None.

Which journal?: Not appropriate for BMC Medicine: an article whose findings are important to those with closely related interests and more suited to BMC Cancer
What next?: Offer publication in BMC Cancer after minor essential revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare I have no competing interests.