Reviewer's report

Title: Migraine aura or TIA? A 5-year follow-up case-control study of women with transient CNS disorders in pregnancy.

Version: 1  Date: 14 April 2007

Reviewer: Robert Kunkel

Reviewer's report:

General:

1. This is an interesting study on a subject that is of interest to me.

2. I think this study is well done and worth publishing. It is further confirmation that neurological symptoms due to a migrainous etiology are generally benign and rarely lead to permanent neurological deficits.

3. The five year followup is impressive.

4. It should be reassuring to the migraineur and those of us who treat migraine patients that if the neurological symptoms fulfill the criteria of migraine (spreading, moving, evolving symptoms lasting less than 60 minutes), there is little likelihood that they are due to a TIA.

5. Since TIA symptoms often last only 1-5 minutes, it would further confirm that symptoms lasting longer than 5 minutes are more likely migrainous if that data is available. You mention that 10 patients had symptoms lasting less than 15 minutes. Is there any data in your records as to whether any of these patients had symptoms for less than 5 minutes? If all had symptoms for more than 5 minutes, this again would be evidence that migrainous neurological symptoms usually last longer than TIA symptoms and is another differentiating characteristic between migraine aura and TIA.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions:

1. As discussed above. If data is available, I think it would be helpful to see if anyone of the migrainuers had brief neurological symptoms that lasted less for than 5 minutes. ( I would guess not)

2. On page 9, the term "hypothyreosis" is used. I think most would now use the term "hypothyroidism"

Which journal?: Appropriate or potentially appropriate for BMC Medicine: an article of importance in its field

What next?: Accept for publication in BMC Medicine after discretionary revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests