Reviewer's report

**Title:** Chronic kidney disease care delivered by U.S. family medicine and internal medicine trainees: Results from an online survey

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 18 September 2006

**Reviewer:** michael germain

**Reviewer's report:**

**General**

1) Although it is valuable to know what the trainees know it is more important to know what practicing PCP know and do. The attendings they surveyed were from the faculty and many were sub-specialists
2) The questions 2-6 could be confusing for a trainee since it asks questions about a doctor in practice
3) Q8: minimally or highly increased is confusing .it should be risk factor yes or no
4) On page 7 it is stated that responses are pooled because there was no difference between FP and IM but then results show a difference in some of the answers. Please clarify or remove that sentence.
5) the question on timed urine vs mathimatical formula for GFR is confusing since it does not state what formula or that it is calculated from the Scr

**Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)**

1) A major limitation of the study is that the survey is not a validated tool. We don't know how well this survey actually determines the knowledge of the person completing the survey. Thsi should be addressed nn the discussion
2) The RPA guidlines for stage 4-5 CKD should be referenced and discussed. the RPA also has developed validated and tested tools to assist in the implementation of the guidelines by the practioners. This is important to discuss since guidllines are issued but tools are not provided for implementation.
3) In the abstract "educational efforts......" sentence needs to be rewritten for sentence structure
4) The authors should give specific recommendations to improve education of trainees and improve guideline compliance.
5)Page 12 line 8: ...use of agents..." is not clear. I assume the authors are discussing ACEi, but that is not clear. I am not sure ref. 47 is relevent since it is an aldactone trial. Either re write or delete the sentence

**Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)**

1) spelling kidney reference 11
2) should be "or" line 4 page 10

**Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)**

**Which journal?:** Appropriate or potentially appropriate for BMC Medicine: an article of importance in its field

**What next?:** Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests’