Reviewer's report

Title: Acute Ischemic Heart Disease and Interventional Cardiology A Time for Pause

Version: 1 Date: 9 August 2006

Reviewer: Attilio Maseri

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript is timely and brave as challenging ‘established’ paradigms takes not only independent thinking but also lots of courage, rather unusual gifts in these days. The ‘one size fits all’ approach (Circulation. 2006;113:f29-30) is rapidly expanding under the heavy pressure from medical industry and with complacent acceptance of cardiologists who can then dispense treatments according to very broad guidelines, without need to consider individual differences, and risks of possible malpractice lawsuits. Often the benefit, though statistically significant, are of little clinical relevance, at least in some patients subgroups, and low emphasis is given to the number of patients that need to be treated to prove the benefits on side effects and on costs.

Bogaty and Brophy illustrate, with cases taken from daily practice, the need for clinical wisdom in the application of guidelines: a welcome resurrection of clinical judgement.

The authors should stress even more:

1. the potential requirements of additional, persistent double/ triple antiplatelet treatment in order to prevent potential late thrombosis in some drug eluting stents;

2. the fact that 70% of coronary arteries has only a mild-moderate pre-existing obstruction at the site of the infarct causing occlusion, whereas some severe stenoses remain stable for years. We are heading towards an era in which the ‘oculo-stenotic reflex’ may represent the only indication for revascularization.

I suggest that this manuscript should be published, in the hope that it may contribute to revive the importance of clinical reasoning for the sake of patients and of healthcare costs.

Which journal?: Appropriate or potentially appropriate for BMC Medicine: an exceptionally interesting article

What next?: Accept for publication in BMC Medicine after discretionary revisions

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests